

## Variations of Relative Clause Translation from Indonesian to English

Tyas Gita Atibrata<sup>1\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Universitas Gadjah Mada, Indonesia

\*Correspondence: [tyasgita@gmail.com](mailto:tyasgita@gmail.com)

### ABSTRACT

*Relative clauses are clauses that explain a noun in order to define or explain a noun further, articles, adjectives, or relative clauses are often used. In an effort to translate from the source language into the target language there is often a strategy used in translating these relative clauses. There are differences in realization in translating these relative clauses, making the researcher wanted to know on how the variations in the equivalent translation of Indonesian relative clauses into English are. There is a novel and its translation used in this research design. The novel that will be used as a source of data in this study is *Bumi Manusia* by Pramoedya Ananta Toer and its translation 'The Earth of Mankind'. Data collection was carried out by listening (observing method) and noting (note-taking method) the relative clauses of data on novels in the Indonesian language as the source language and their translation into the target language. The data were then analyzed to find equivalent relative clause variants in Indonesian in English. By analysing the data it can be found that the variations of relative clause translation from Indonesian to English are (1) relative clauses (with relative pronoun *who, which, that, whose, whom*), (2) adjectives, (3) present participle, (4) past participle, (5) noun phrase, (6) prepositional phrase, (7) noun class, and (8) verb.*

### ARTICLE HISTORY

Published December 30<sup>th</sup> 2022



### KEYWORDS

English; Indonesian; Relative Clauses; Translation

### ARTICLE LICENCE

© 2022 Universitas Hasanuddin  
Under the license CC BY-SA  
4.0



### 1. Introduction

Translation is transferring the message of a text from the source language to the target language. Catford (1965: 20) states that translation can be defined by replacing the source language text with the equivalent text in the target language. A translation often faces several obstacles in re-expressing the meaning from the source language to the target language. This is because there are differences between the source language and the target language. This difference is due, among others, to lexicon factors, grammatical structures to the cultural context contained in the target text. This research will focus on differences in grammatical structures in translating English into Indonesian. The grammatical structure that will be examined is the relative clauses of Indonesian and English.

Relative clauses are clauses that explain a noun in order to define or explain a noun further, articles, adjectives, or relative clauses are often used. In an effort to translate from the source language into the target language, there is often a strategy used in translating these relative clauses. The following are some examples found in the novel *Bumi Manusia* by Pramoedya Ananta Toer and its translation 'The Earth of Mankind'.

(1a) *Waktu mamanya, seorang Indo juga, hendak melahirkan, ayahnya juga Indo, buru-buru membawanya ke Tanjung Perak, naik ke atas kapal Van Heemskerck yang sedang berlabuh, melahirkan di sana, dan: ia bukan hanya kawula Belanda, ia mendapat kewarganegaraan Belanda.*(BM43)

(1b) When his mother, an Indo, was about to give birth, his father, also an Indo, rushed her to Perak Harbor, boarded the ship Van Heemskerck, **which was tied up in port**, so she had the child there, and he not only became a Dutch subject but a Dutch citizen as well.(TEoM43)

In the relative clause (1a) the noun phrase that is explained is the *kapal Van Heemskerck* so that the translation in (1b) uses the relative pronoun 'which'. There is a shift in the syntactic structure, active to passive, in data translation

(1a). The verb in the relative clause (1a) is an active *berlabuh* verb which is then translated into a passive verb 'was tied up' in the relative clause (1b)

(2a) *Sungguh merugi generasi sebelum aku – generasi yang sudah puas dengan banyaknya jejak-langkah sendiri di lorong-lorong kampungnya itu.*(BM8)

(2b) How deprived had the generation before me been—a generation **that had been satisfied with the accumulation of its own footsteps in the lanes of its-villages.**(TEoM8)

The relative clause (2a) describes the noun *generasi*. Relative clause (2a) is a restrictive relative clause which limits nouns only to what is explained by the relative clause. In the translation there is a shift in syntactic elements from active to passive. The relative clause (2a) is an active sentence with the predicate *yang sudah puas* while in translation (2b) it becomes a passive sentence with the verb had been satisfied.

By looking at the linguistic phenomena that occur in the equivalent relative clauses of Indonesian nouns in English, the following question is formulated: What are the different types of comparative clauses of Indonesian into English.

## 2. Method

The data in this study are in the form of relative clauses in the context of sentences. The data was taken from the original novel in Indonesian and its translation in English. There are novels and translations used in this research design. The novel that will be used as a data source in this study is *Bumi Manusia* by Pramoedya Ananta Toer and its translation 'The Earth of Mankind'. Data collection was carried out by reading the English version of the novel while identifying relative clauses. Then the data is taken in the form of a different number of sentence units for each data due to the context it contains. Then the relative clause is searched for its equivalent in the English translation version of the data source. The data that has been identified is taken with the same sentence fragment as the Indonesian language data, with the intention that the context of the use of the equivalent marker in English can be seen.

Data collection was carried out by listening (observing method) and noting (note-taking method) the relative clauses of data on novels in the Indonesian language as the source language and their translation into the target language. This method is a method of collecting data by listening to the use of language without participating in the conversation process which is followed by recording (Sudaryanto, 1993: 133; Mahsun, 2005: 92). The next step is to record the relative clauses in the target language novels and their equivalents in the translation novels. The available data pair is then paired in one data number. Each data number contains only one pair of lingual languages in the form of noun phrases to be analyzed, even though in the sentences where the relative clause is used, there are other relative clauses. Relative clauses to be analyzed in the Indonesian version and its equivalent in the English version for each data number are marked in bold. Data is presented with coding in the form of title abbreviations and data sequence numbers. Data coding in this study was divided into two types, namely the data code for the English version and the data code for the Indonesian version. The data were then analyzed according to the characteristics of the Indonesian and English relative clauses. The Indonesian data was then compared with the English equivalent. The data were then analyzed to find equivalent relative clause variants in Indonesian in English.

## 3. Variation of Relative Clause Translation from Indonesian to English

This study found that Indonesian relative clauses were translated into fourteen English equivalents. The fourteen forms are: (1) relative clause, (2) adjective, (3) present participle, (4) past participle, (5) determiner, (6) noun phrase, (7) clause nouns, (8) prepositional phrases (9) verbs. The many variations that occur in the translation of Indonesian relative clauses into English are due to several factors, namely translation techniques, different systems of source language and target language, and others. The explanation of the various translations of Indonesian relative clauses into English will be described as follows.

### 3.1. Relative Clauses that are translated into Relative Clauses with relative pronouns 'who'

The relative pronoun who is used in relative clauses that describe a subject or object with reference to the noun being explained is a person.

(3a) *Betapa aku berterimakasih pada semua dan setiap orang yang telah berjerih-payah untuk melahirkan keajaiban baru itu.*(BM9)

(3b) I was truly grateful to all those people who had worked so tirelessly to give birth to these new wonders.(TEoM9)

In (3a) the relative clause in the sentence explaining the noun phrase "everyone" is translated into an English relative clause with the relative pronoun who (3b). The noun phrase explained by the relative clause refers to the human entity so that it is translated with the relative pronoun who.

(4a)*Di kantorpos-kantorpos, kata sang samsus pula, kadang didapatkan surat lamaran yang ditujukan pada dara yang jauh dan tinggi di sana itu.*(BM16)

(4b)At the post offices, so rumor was also whispered, letters were occasionally received proposing marriage to this maiden who lived so far away and so high above.(TEoM16)

In (4a) the relative clause in the sentence explains the noun *dara*. *Dara* in this sentence does not mean a type of bird but is a word that has a connotative meaning meaning a young woman. This makes the translation of the relative clause in (4b) use the relative pronoun 'who'.

### 3.2. Relative Clauses that are translated into Relative Clauses with relative pronouns 'which'

The relative pronoun 'which' is used in relative clauses that describe subjects or objects with reference to noun phrases in the form of objects or animals.

(5a)*Ilmu dan pengetahuan, yang kudapatkan dari sekolah dan kusaksikan sendiri pernyataannya dalam hidup, telah membikin pribadiku menjadi agak berbeda dari sebangsaku pada umumnya.*(BM5)

(5b) This science and learning, which I had been taught at school and which I saw manifested in life all around me, meant that I was rather different from the general run of my countrymen.(TEoM5)

The relative clause (5a) explains the noun phrase " *Ilmu dan pengetahuan* which refers to an abstract entity so that in translation (5b) it uses 'which' as a relative pronoun. There is a shift in syntax in the translation of the English relative clause (5b). The relative clause (5a) has two passive verbs with the pronoun 'aku' shortened to become the affix 'ku-'. In translation (5b) the two passive verbs (*kudapatkan* and *kusaksikan*) become passive and active verbs. The passive verb *kudapatkan* is translated into the passive verb had been thought, while the passive verb *kusaksikan* is translated into the active verb saw.

(6a) *Salah satu hasil ilmu-pengetahuan yang tak habis-habis kukagumi adalah percetakan, terutama zincografi.* (BM7)

(6b) One of the products of science at which I never stopped marveling was printing, especially zincography. (TEoM7)

In the relative clause (6a) the noun phrase explained by the relative clause is *Salah satu hasil ilmu-pengetahuan* translated into 'one of the products of science'. The noun phrase refers to an abstract noun so that the relative pronoun 'which' is used in the equivalent relative clause. In the translation of relative clauses (6a) there is a shift in the syntactic structure from passive to active. The passive verb in the relative clause, *kukagumi* becomes the active verb 'stopped marveling'.

### 3.3. The Relative Clause which is translated into the Relative Clause with the relative pronoun 'whose'

The use of the relative pronoun 'whose' in a relative clause is used to show ownership. 'Whose' is used to show someone's or something's possession.

(7a) *Dalam hidupku, baru seumur jagung, sudah dapat kurasai: ilmu pengetahuan telah memberikan padaku suatu restu yang tiada terhingga indahnya.* (BM2)

(7b) I was still very young, just the age of a corn plant, yet I had already experienced modern learning and science: They had bestowed upon me a blessing **whose beauty was beyond description.** (TEoM2)

The relative clause (7a) has an ownership marker in the form of the affix *-nya* to the noun *indahnyanya* so that the translation into the English relative clause (7b) uses the relative pronoun 'whose'. The relative pronoun whose also has two functions, namely as a marker of ownership and a marker of relative clauses, this is different from the Indonesian language grammatical rules which distinguish the marker. Relative pronoun in Indonesian use *yang* while possessive markers use the affix *-nya*.

### 3.4. Relative Clauses that are translated into Relative Clauses with the relative pronoun 'that'

The use of the relative pronoun 'that' is used to describe noun phrases in the form of goods or animal entities. The relative pronoun 'that' is used in restrictive relative clauses, while the relative pronoun 'who' is used in non-restrictive relative clauses.

(8a) *Sungguh merugi generasi sebelum aku – generasi yang sudah puas dengan banyaknya jejak-langkah sendiri di lorong-lorong kampungnya itu.*(BM8)

(8b) How deprived had the generation before me been—a generation **that had been satisfied with the accumulation of its own footsteps in the lanes of its-villages.**(TEoM8)

The relative clause (8a) describes the noun *generasi*. Relative clause (8a) is a restrictive relative clause which limits nouns only to what is explained by the relative clause. In the translation there is a shift in syntactic elements from active to passive. The relative clause (8a) is an active sentence with the predicate *sudah puas* while in its translation (8b) it becomes a passive sentence with the verb 'had been satisfied'.

### 3.5. Relative Clauses that are translated into Relative Clauses with the relative pronoun 'whom'

The use of the pronoun 'whom' in the relative clause is used to describe objects. Huddleston et al. (2002) stated that the relative pronoun 'whom' is used if what is explained by the relative clause in a sentence is in the form of a noun or noun phrase that has a syntactic function as an object.

(9a) *Dan sekarang Suurhof sedang hendak mempermain-mainkan aku di hadapan gadis dunia yang ia kehendaki aku taklukkan.*(BM47)

(9b) And now Suurhof wanted to make fun of me in front of this other earthly girl **whom he also wanted me to conquer.** (TEoM47)

In (9a) there is a relative clause *yang ia kehendaki aku taklukkan*. The relative clause is translated as 'whom he also wanted me to conquer'. The relative clause in target language uses the relative 'whom' that is used for objects.

### 3.6. Relative Clauses that are translated into Adjectives

The translation of Indonesian relative clauses into English is not only expressed in relative clauses but also other grammatical elements. Adjectives are grammatical units that are most often found as translations of relative clauses. Adjectives are a type of word that describes a noun, this property is the same as that of a relative clause as a relative that describes a noun. The following are examples of data findings on the translation of Indonesian relative clauses into English in the form of adjectives.

(10a) *Hatiku tetap curiga melihat liriknya yang tajam.* (BM57)

(10b) **His sharp glance** did nothing to dispel my suspicions. (TEoM57)

In data (10a) the relative clause *tajam* is translated into an adjective 'sharp' in English (10b). This shift in the translation changes the structure and position of the noun phrases it translates. The noun phrase *liriknya yang tajam* has a relative clause as a post modifier of the central element *liriknya* which is changed to a noun phrase with a pre-modifier adjective 'sharp', the possessive pronoun 'his' is added, and the noun head is 'glance'. In the translation, the relative clause in (10b) is shortened to an adjective so that a relative clause is not needed to explain the noun.

### 3.6. Relative Clauses that are translated into Determiner

Determiners are words that come before nouns. The determiner is important as a relative introducing or providing context for the noun. In this study, we found equivalent forms of Indonesian relative clauses which were translated into English determiners. The following are examples and explanations.

(11a) *Dia membaca buku-buku Eropa, Nyai yang seorang ini!* (BM109)

(11b) She reads European books, **this nyai**. (TEoM109)

In (11a) and (11b) there is a shift in syntactic elements in the translation. In (11a) the noun phrase *Nyai yang seorang ini* has a relative clause *yang seorang ini* as a back description with the noun *Nyai* as the central element. However, in the translation (11b), the relative clause is translated into the determiner *this* which is located before the central element, *nyai*. In the translation there is omission of a person and only translating this word into determiner *this*.

### 3.7. Relative Clauses that are translated into Relative Clauses into Present Participle

Relative clauses are also translated into the present participle. The present participle is a form of a verb in English that ends in *-ing*. The present participle has various functions in sentences. The present participle can function as a verb or an adjective. The present participle as an embodiment of the relative clause translation functions as an adjective. The following are some examples of these findings:

(12a) *"Alleluya, Minke, apa kabar hari ini?" tegurnya dalam Prancis yang memaksa aku menggunakan bahasanya.* (BM35)

(12b) He greeted me in French, **forcing me to use his language.** (TEoM35)

In data (12a) there is a relative clause *yang memaksa aku menggunakan bahasanya* which explains the noun *Prancis*. The relative clause is translated into the present participle 'forcing me to use his language'. In this translation, the relative clause is compressed into the present participle.

### 3.8. Relative Clauses that are translated into Relative Clauses into the Past Participle

Relative clauses are often translated into the Past Participle form. The past participle is a non-finite verb which can function not only as a verb but also as an adjective. The past participle that functions as an adjective has a passive character. Here are some examples of relative clauses that are translated into past participles.

(13a) *Pertandingan, pertunjukan, pameran ketrampilan dan kebiasaan yang dipelajari orang dari Eropa - sepakbola, standen, kasti.* (BM33)

(13b) All the school had gone crazy celebrating the coronation: competitions, performances, exhibitions of all those skills and abilities **studied** by Europeans—soccer, acrobatics, and softball. (TEoM33)

In data (13a) there is a relative clause *yang dipelajari orang dari Eropa*. The relative clause is translated into past participle 'studied by Europeans'. The relative clause in the data has a passive verb which is very suitable to be translated into the past participle. Hence, the relative clause is a passive sentence which is translated into a passive adjective in the past participle form.

### 3.9. Relative Clauses translated into Noun Phrases

Relative clauses are also translated into noun phrases. The following is some of these findings

(14a) *Annelies hampir-hampir tak makan, hanya karena memperhatikan dan melayani aku yang seorang ini.* (BM120)

(14b) Annelies hardly ate anything, only because of the attention she paid to serving me and **me alone.** (TEoM120)

In data (14a) there is a relative clause *yang seorang ini* which explains the noun *aku*. The relative clause is translated into a noun phrase 'me alone'. In the relative clause (14a) is a relative clause of the transsubject which has the noun phrase *seorang ini* as its predicate. In translation, the relative clause turns into a noun phrase and becomes a constituent after the conjunction *and*.

### 3.10. Relative Clauses Translated into Prepositional Phrases

In the translation of Indonesian relative clauses into English, it sometimes changes into a prepositional phrase. A prepositional phrase in English is a phrase that begins with a preposition and is followed by a prepositional object in the form of a noun or noun phrase. Prepositional phrases are functioned to provide information in the form of place, time, or condition. So, prepositional phrases can act like adjectives or adverbs in sentences. The following is an example of translating an Indonesian relative clause that turns into a prepositional phrase in English.

(15a) *Dan kami berjalan terus beberapa ratus meter ke belakang melalui jalanan yang dilapisi krikil kali.* (BM126)

(15b) ... and we walked several hundred meters along a path laid **with river gravel**. (TEoM126)

In data (15a) there is a relative clause *yang dilapisi krikil kali*. The relative clause explains the noun *jalanan*. In data (15b) the relative clause is translated into a prepositional phrase 'with river gravel'. The prepositional phrase begins with the preposition 'with' followed by the noun phrase 'river gravel'. Besides there is a shift in form from a relative clause to a prepositional phrase, there is also a shift in function. In the target language, the prepositional phrase does not explain the noun but describes the verb, namely the verb 'laid'.

### 3.11. Relative Clauses that are translated into Noun Clauses

Indonesian relative clauses in their translation into English are often also translated into noun clauses. Noun clauses can act as subjects or objects.

(16a) *Itu yang terpenting bagiku.* (BM39)

(16b) That is **what interests me most**. (TEoM39)

In data (16a) there is a relative clause *yang terpenting bagiku* which is translated into 'what interests me most'. There is a shift in function and role in the translation of relative clauses in data (16a). In data (16a) the relative clause is attached to the noun *itu* and becomes part of the noun phrase, whereas in translation, apart from changing to a noun clause, it has also shifted its function to become a complement.

### 3.12. Relative Clauses translated into Verbs

In the translation of Indonesian relative clauses into English, verb forms are found in the translation. The following are some examples of translation data

(17a) *Apa yang hidup dalam keluarga ini?* (BM101)

(17b) What **was going on** in this family? (TEoM101)

In data (17a) there is a relative clause *yang hidup*. The relative clause explains the pronoun *apa*. The word *apa* in the Big Indonesian Dictionary is categorized as a pronoun which is a question word to replace something. The relative clause is translated into English into the verb form 'was going on'.

## 4. Conclusion

Based on the previous discussion, some conclusions can be drawn. The relative clause in Indonesian can have some variations in its translation in English. The variations of relative clause translation from Indonesian to English are (1) relative clauses (with relative pronoun who, which, that, whose, whom), (2) adjectives, (3) present participle, (4) past participle, (5) noun phrase, (6) prepositional phrase, (7) noun class, and (8) verb. It can be concluded that the relative clauses are not always translated into relative clause. There are some other syntactic forms other than relative clauses when it is translated into English. However all the variants of relative clause translation from Indonesian to English are emerged in order to modify the head noun.

## Acknowledgments

This article is a part of dissertation research. Hence, the author expresses her gratitude to Prof. Dr. I Dewa Putu Wijana, S.U., M.A. and Dr. Adi Sutrisno, M. A. as the promoter and co-promoter who had given advices and guidances in the writing dissertation process. Suggestions and guidance that the author received are very helpful in the process of developing this research.

## References

- Alla, Ahmed Saber Abd. (2008). *Klausa Relatif bahasa Indonesia dan klausa relatif bahasa Arab: Sebuah Studi Kontrastif*. Yogyakarta: UGM. Tesis.
- Ambiya, Mujahid Zenul. (2018). Keberlakuan Nomina sebagai Predikat dalam Kalimat Bahasa Indonesia: Kajian Sintaksis. *Ranah: Jurnal Kajian Bahasa*, 7 (1), 49—68.
- Agustina. (2009). *Klausa Relatif: Perspektif Baru dalam Gramatika Deskriptif Bahasa Indonesia*. Bandung: Pustaka Reka Cipta.
- Catford, J.C. (1965). *A Linguistic Theory Of Translation*. Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press
- Comrie, Bernard. (1992). *Language Universals and Linguistic Typology*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.
- Comrie, Bernard. (2003). The Verb-Marking Relative Clause Strategy with Special Reference to Austronesian Languages. *Linguistik Indonesia*, 21 (1).
- Dalilan. (2003). *Klausa Relatif Bahasa Inggris dan Bahasa Indonesia: Analisis Kontrastif Strategi Perelatifan, Fungsi, dan Karakteristik Alat Perelatif*. Yogyakarta: UGM. Tesis.
- Eugene, A. Nida., & Charles R. Taber. (1969). *The Theory and Practice of Translation*. Leiden: E.J Brill.
- Hoed, B. H. (2006). *Penerjemahan dan Kebudayaan*. Bandung: Dunia Pustaka Jaya.
- Huddleston, Rodney. (1989.) *Introduction to The Grammar of English*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Huddleston, R.D & G. Pullum. (2002). *The Cambridge Grammar of the English Language*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Kridalaksana, Harimurti. (2008). *Kamus Linguistik*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Leech, Geoffrey., & Jan Svartvik. (1973). *A Communicative Grammar of English*. Essex: Longman group.
- Mahsun. (2005). *Metode Penelitian Bahasa: Tahapan Strategi, Metode, dan Tekniknya*. Jakarta: PT. Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Miller, Jim. (2002). *Introduction to English Syntax*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Moeliono, Anton M., & Dardjowidjojo, Soenjono. (2003). *Tata Bahasa Baku bahasa Indonesia*. Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press
- Newmark, Peter. (1988). *A Textbook of Translation*. New York: Prentice Hall.
- Quirk, Randrep., Sidney Greenbaum., Geoffrey Leech., & Jan Svartvik. (1972). *A Grammar of Contemporary English*. London: Longman Group.
- Radford, Andrew., Martin Atkinson., David Britain., Harald Clahsen., & Andrew Spencer. (1999). *Linguistics: An Introduction*. Cambridge: Cambridge Univeristy Press.
- Radford, Andrew. (1997). *Syntax: A Minimalist Introduction*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Radford, Andrew. (2019). *Relative Clauses: Structure and Variation in Everyday English..* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Ramlan, M. (2001). *Ilmu Bahasa Indonesia: Sintaksis*. Yogyakarta: CV. Karyono.
- Sneddon, James Neil. (1996). *Indonesian Reference Grammar*. London and New York: Routledge
- Sudaryanto. (1993). *Metode dan Aneka Teknik Analisis Bahasa*. Yogyakarta: Duta Wacana University Press.
- Sugono, Dendy. (1994). *Berbahasa Indonesia dengan Benar*. Jakarta : Puspa Swara.
- Toer, Pramudya Ananta. (2005). *Bumi Manusia*. Jakarta Timur: Lentera Dipantara
- Thomson, A.J., & A.V. Martinet. (1983). *A Practical English Grammar*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Venuti, Lawrence. (1995). *The Translator's Invisibility: A History of Translation*. London: Routledge.