

Bridging the Employment Gap: Analyzing the Implementation of Padang City's Workforce Placement Program

Adhinda Herman Putri^{1*}, Muhammad Ichsan Kabullah², Nila Wahyuni³

¹ Public Administration Program, Andalas University, Indonesia.

^{2,3} Department of Public Administration, Andalas University, Indonesia.

*E-mail: adhindahermanputri@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords: policy implementation; public policy; workforce placement; labor

How to cite:

Putri, A. H., Kabullah, M. I., & Wahyuni, N. (2025). Bridging the Employment Gap: Analyzing the Implementation of Padang City's Workforce Placement Program. *JAKPP (Jurnal Analisis Kebijakan dan Pelayanan Publik)*, 11(2), 120-142

DOI:

<https://doi.org/10.31947/jakpp.v11i2.42525>

Copyright: © 2025 Adhinda Herman Putri, Muhammad Ichsan Kabullah, Nila Wahyuni

This work is licensed under CC BY-NC 4.0. To view a copy of this license, visit

<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

ABSTRACT

This research examines the implementation of the Manpower Placement Program in Padang City, West Sumatra, addressing the city's high unemployment rate. Employing a qualitative approach with descriptive methods, the study utilizes documentation and interviews with key informants from the Manpower and Industry Office, employers, and private placement agencies. The study reveals suboptimal program implementation, with objectives not fully achieved despite a decreased open unemployment rate. Padang City still faces the highest unemployment rate in West Sumatra, with a significant disparity between registered and placed job seekers. Challenges identified include inadequate human and non-human resources within the Manpower and Industry Office, suboptimal communication and coordination between implementers and external organizations, a mismatch between job seeker competencies and employer demands, and insufficient support from political elites and local regulations. The research emphasizes the need to develop localized policy frameworks that address Padang's unique socio-economic conditions, implement innovative resource strategies, enhance coordination mechanisms, and adopt context-sensitive approaches to balance national directives with local realities. These recommendations aim to improve the program's effectiveness and align it with the city's needs and challenges. This study's critical implication is that ineffective policy implementation highlights the need for a comprehensive, localized approach to address critical issues, considering the city's unique socio-economic conditions and resource constraints.

Introduction

The issue of employment in Indonesia remains a significant concern for the government, with the high unemployment rate being a central aspect of this challenge. Multiple interrelated factors contribute to unemployment, chief among them being the imbalance between job seekers and labor absorption. This imbalance is primarily attributed to insufficient governmental action in labor placement, resulting in suboptimal absorption of the existing workforce and consequently increasing unemployment (Soleh, 2017). Unemployment is a crucial labor problem and a complex economic issue that significantly impacts social welfare (Sifa, 2022; Barbăneagră & Jomir, 2024).

Recent data from the Central Bureau of Statistics (BPS) indicates a slight improvement, with the open unemployment rate in Indonesia reaching 5.32 percent in August 2023, a decrease of 0.54 percent compared to the previous year. However, regional disparities persist, as evidenced by the situation in West Sumatra Province. As seen in Table 1, the Central Bureau of Statistics of West Sumatra Province (2023) reports that the open unemployment rate in the region stood at 5.94 percent in August 2023, with Padang City recording the highest rate at 10.86 percent. This data underscores the need for targeted interventions and region-specific strategies to address unemployment effectively.

Despite marginal improvements, Indonesia's persistent unemployment issue highlights the complex interplay of factors influencing labor market dynamics. It necessitates a comprehensive approach that addresses national and regional challenges, emphasizing the critical role of effective government policies in labor placement and economic development.

Table 1. Open Unemployment Rate in West Sumatera in 2021-2023

Districts/City	TPT by District/City (Percent)		
	2021	2022	2023
District of Kepulauan Mentawai	2.79	1.39	1,33
District of Pesisir Selatan	5.97	4.61	4,75
District of Solok	4.67	5,89	4,99
District of Sijunjung	3.57	4.87	4,71
District of Tanah Datar	4.63	5.91	5,35
District of Padang Pariaman	8.41	6.60	6,69
District of Agam	5.06	4.93	4,96
District of Lima Puluh Kota	2.25	3.72	3,95
District of Pasaman	4.92	5.38	5,09

Districts/City	TPT by District/City (Percent)		
	2021	2022	2023
District of Solok Selatan	4.84	3.71	2,57
District of Dharmasraya	5.00	6.23	6,22
District of Pasaman Barat	5.02	6.33	6,01
City of Padang	13.37	11.69	10,86
City of Solok	5.15	3.90	3,72
City of Sawahlunto	6.38	5.00	4,98
City of Padang Panjang	4.90	4.84	5,49
City of Bukittinggi	6.09	4.90	4,99
City of Payakumbuh	6.47	5.16	4,84
City of Pariaman	6.09	5.19	5,68
Total	6.52	6.28	5,94

Source: Central Bureau of Statistics West Sumatra (2023)

The abnormally high unemployment rate in Padang City highlights a development problem that has remained unresolved, necessitating urgent action from the local government. To combat this issue, various stakeholders, including the Manpower and Industry Office of Padang City, employers, and Private Manpower Placement Agencies (LPTKS), have been tasked with implementing labor placement programs. However, the significant disparity between registered job seekers and successful placements over the past three years indicates the presence of substantial inhibiting factors that impede the optimal execution of these initiatives (Shown in Table 2).

While the labor placement program aims to reduce unemployment and enhance the quality of the local workforce, several critical issues hinder its effective implementation. Preliminary observations and interviews with relevant parties have revealed a multifaceted set of challenges that warrant further investigation. These include inadequate human resources within the Manpower and Industry Office, limited socialization efforts with employers, and insufficient political support for the program.

The implementation agency's lack of adequate human resources could compromise the program's management and execution capabilities. Furthermore, insufficient socialization with employers about the labor placement program may result in low participation rates and limited understanding of how to access and utilize the available resources. The absence of strong political support, manifested through a lack of supportive policies and inter-agency coordination, further

exacerbates the situation, leading to inadequate facilities and infrastructure that impede the achievement of program objectives.

Table 2. Number of Job Seekers Registered and Placed in Padang City in 2021-2023

Year	Registered Job Seekers	Job Seekers Placed
2021	5.060	650
2022	3.953	789
2023	3.601	701
Total	12.614	2.140

Source: Padang City Labour and Industry Office (2023)

While these preliminary findings provide valuable insights, they also reveal significant research gaps that require further examination. The complex interplay between institutional capacity, stakeholder engagement, and political support in the context of labor placement programs remains understudied, particularly in regional settings like Padang City (Aurich-Beerheide et al., 2015; Gibbs et al., 2001) and their relative importance in determining success or failure is yet to be fully elucidated.

This study aims to address these research gaps by conducting an in-depth investigation into implementing the labor placement program in Padang City. By unraveling the complexities of the employment gap and examining the various factors that influence program effectiveness, this research seeks to contribute to developing more targeted and efficient strategies for reducing unemployment in the region. The findings of this study will not only provide valuable insights for policymakers and practitioners in Padang City but also offer potential lessons for addressing similar challenges in other regions facing persistent unemployment issues

Literature Review

According to Dye (2008), public policy is whatever governments choose to or should not do. This concept is very broad because public policy includes what the government does not do in addition to what the government does when the government is faced with public issues. Dye argues that something the government does not do is also a state policy because it will have the same impact as something the government does. In another definition, Dye (2008) also explained, '...What governments do, why they do it, and what difference it makes that policy is something that the government does for specific reasons, and the results of that work will produce something. Policy implementation is a way to achieve the objectives of a policy. Public policy cannot stop with the existence of a program, but the policy must be able to be implemented in the form of a program to answer the needs of the community (Haris, 2024). From the description of several experts referred to by the author, it can be concluded that public policy is several actions

taken by the government to do or not do something to produce specific changes through various processes.

Policy implementation is a very important and strategic stage in a public policy process because a policy must be implemented to achieve the previously planned goals. According to Nugroho (2014), policy implementation can be interpreted as one of the critical stages because it is separated from the policy formulation process, where the success rate of a policy is highly dependent on its implementation. Policy implementation is one of the most substantial processes; problems are often not predicted beforehand, which causes the policy to fail in its implementation (Iva, 2015).

The policy implementation model proposed by Van Meter and Van Horn (1975) provides a comprehensive framework for analyzing the implementation of workforce placement programs in Padang City, Indonesia. This model emphasizes the importance of six key variables in measuring policy implementation: policy size and objectives, resources, implementing agent characteristics, implementing disposition, inter-organizational communication and implementing activities, and the social, economic, and political environment. The relevance of this model to the workforce placement program in Padang City lies in its focus on implementation performance and its broad consideration of internal and external factors that contribute to policy success.

Van Meter and Van Horn's top-down approach underscores the significance of clear policy objectives and standards set by policymakers, which is crucial for effective workforce placement programs. This approach ensures that the program's goals are well-defined and understood by all stakeholders involved in its implementation (Shahriar & Khan, 2016). Furthermore, the model highlights the importance of inter-organizational communication, emphasizing the need for effective collaboration between government agencies, private sector employers, and educational institutions involved in workforce placement.

The concept also stresses the importance of adequate resources and incentives, which are critical for successfully implementing workforce placement policies in Padang City. By considering the characteristics of implementing agencies, the model accounts for the capacity and competence of local agencies responsible for workforce placement, directly impacting the policy's success (Polma et al., 2021). Additionally, the framework considers the specific economic and social context of Padang City, allowing for tailored implementation strategies that address local needs and challenges.

The policy-action continuum recognized by Van Meter and Horn's concept acknowledges the dynamic nature of policy implementation, allowing for adaptations to changing labor market conditions in Padang City. This flexibility is crucial in a rapidly evolving economic landscape, where workforce needs and opportunities may shift over time (Howlett, & Ramesh, 2022). Moreover, the model includes feedback mechanisms essential for continuously improving workforce placement strategies in the local context.

Lastly, the framework emphasizes the importance of stakeholder engagement, which is crucial for addressing the diverse needs and perspectives of various groups involved in or affected by workforce placement initiatives (Edlmann & Grobbelaar, 2021). This inclusive approach ensures that the program remains responsive to the needs of job seekers, employers, and the broader community.

In conclusion, Van Meter and Van Horn's policy implementation model provides a robust and comprehensive framework for analyzing and improving the workforce placement program in Padang City. By considering multiple variables and emphasizing the interplay between policy objectives, implementing agencies, and the broader socio-economic context, this model offers valuable insights for policymakers and practitioners seeking to enhance the effectiveness of workforce placement initiatives in the region.

Several previous related studies have examined policy implementation to tackle unemployment issues. First, Nasri's research (2021) concerned the empowerment and placement of local workers in Kunto Darussalam District. This research provides an in-depth analysis of the inhibiting factors in implementing local workforce policies, such as the lack of socialization and training by related agencies and the low competitiveness of local workers so this research provides important insights into the role of related agencies and the workforce itself related to the smooth placement of the implemented workforce.

Furthermore, Putra's research (2022) studies Amendments to Regional Regulation Number 4 of 2002 concerning the Placement of Local Workers. Also, it explains the obstacles in implementing policies that cause implementation not to be carried out correctly. This is because there is a significant lack of human, financial, and time resources. In addition, communication between implementers has also not been running at all, so the implementation of this policy is still not optimal. This research provides an in-depth analysis of how the role of internal and external environments in the policy environment mutually influences policy implementation.

Research Methods

This research was conducted from January to October 2024 in Padang City. This research uses a qualitative approach using descriptive methods where researchers describe the problem according to what happens. According to Mardalis (2010), descriptive research is intended to obtain information about the current situation and see the relationship between the variables to be studied. This research uses a qualitative method because the focus is to understand the implementation of the labor placement program in Padang City. This method allows researchers to gather information directly from the parties involved, such as agency employees, employers, and job seekers, to obtain a clearer picture of the processes, challenges, and influences of the external environment in the program.

Furthermore, Suyitno (2018) explains that qualitative data collection techniques are usually temporary, and their use is determined by the context of the

problem and the description of the data to be obtained. The data used in this study consisted of primary and secondary data in the form of interviews with research informants and from related documents in the form of books, annual reports, and other relevant policies.

The data collection process was carried out using interviews and documentation. The selection of informants in this study was carried out using a purposive sampling technique. Purposive sampling is an informant selection technique based on research needs. This means that each informant taken from the population is selected deliberately based on specific considerations (Sugiyono, 2021). Researchers use this technique to select people who are considered capable of providing information on research conducted by researchers, making it easier for researchers to get the correct information based on research needs.

The informants in this study totaled 9 with the following details: 1) Head of the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office; 2) Head of Placement and Expansion of Employment Opportunities; 3) Intermediate Expert Job Introduction; 4) Junior Expert Job Introduction (2 people); 5) First Expert Job Introduction; 6) Labour Material Analyst and Expansion of Employment Opportunities; 7) Employers; and 8) Private Labour Placement Agencies in Padang City.

This research uses the data analysis method with the Miles and Huberman (2014) data analysis technique, which consists of 4 stages, namely: 1) data collection, 2) data reduction, 3) data presentation, and 4) conclusion drawing. Furthermore, in testing the validity of the data in this study, researchers used data triangulation techniques. According to Moleong (2009), triangulation is a data validity-checking technique that utilizes something else in comparing the results of interviews with research objects. There are three types of triangulations: source, technique, and time. The type of triangulation used in this research is source triangulation, where researchers try to compare and check the degree of trust in information obtained through different sources.

Results and Discussion

Policy implementation is a very important stage in the public policy process. This is because the implementation of public policy is the stage that determines whether the policy or program has been appropriately implemented by the targets previously set by the policy formulator. This research was conducted to describe the implementation process of the labor placement program in Padang City. As the researcher has described in the first chapter's background chapter of the problem, the number of labor placements is not balanced with registered job seekers. This research aims to see how the implementation of the manpower placement program in Padang City is using the concept of policy implementation from Van Meter and Van Horn (1975) as follows:

Policy Size and Objectives

Policy measures and objectives outline the objectives of policy decisions that have been set thoroughly, which are evidence and can be measured easily in some implementation cases (Winarno, 2012). In implementing the workforce placement program at the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office, there are objectives of the workforce placement program in the Minister of Manpower Regulation Number 39 of 2016. When viewed from the regulation on workforce placement, this program should run according to the contents and objectives of the policy set by the central government.

The Minister of Manpower Regulation No. 39/2016 on Manpower Placement, which is the basic regulation in the manpower placement program, has provided clear steps and definitions regarding the success measure of the program conducted by the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office. Regarding the clarity of policy goals and objectives in this labor placement program, the researcher interviewed the Head of the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office:

“The purpose of this workforce placement program is under what has been explained in Minister of Manpower Regulation Number 39 of 2016, which places job seekers according to their interests and talents and allows employers to find job seekers who match their needs. In addition, the agency's target with this program is to help reduce the unemployment rate in Padang City.” (Interview on 31 July 2024)

The objectives of the labor placement program are set out in the Minister of Manpower Regulation No. 39/2016 on Labour Placement Chapter I General Provisions Article 3, which reads:

1. Labour placement aims to place workers in positions under the qualifications of expertise, skills, interests, talents, and abilities regarding dignity, human rights, and legal protection.
2. Manpower placement services are integrated into one manpower placement system, which includes job seekers, job vacancies, GPA, inter-employment mechanisms, and manpower placement institutions.

In addition to referring to the Minister of Manpower Regulation No. 39/2016 on Manpower Placement, the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office also explains that the purpose of the manpower placement program is to reduce the number of unemployed people in Padang City. This is contained in the annual performance achievement of the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office in the 2023 Government Agency Performance Accountability Report (LAKIP) as follows:

Table 3. Performance Outcomes of the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office in the Manpower Placement Program in 2023

Target	Performance Indicator	Target	Realisation	Achievement
Decreasing Unemployment Rate	Percentage of Open Unemployment Rate	10,74%	10,86%	98%

Target Formulation:

$$\frac{\text{Number of Unemployed in Year } n}{\text{Number Labour Force in Year } n} \times 100\%$$

Source: Padang City Manpower and Industry Office, (2023)

Based on Table 3 above, it can be seen that the target of the workforce placement program at the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office is to reduce the unemployment rate in Padang City, with a target of 10.74%, then for the realization of this program is 10.86%. This means that the desired target of this program has exceeded the target set with a percentage achievement of 98% in the 'very high' achievement category. However, even though the program has exceeded the set target and the Open Unemployment Rate in Padang City has decreased, the program's implementation still cannot be entirely successful. This is because Padang City still has the highest open unemployment rate in West Sumatra, and it is still at an abnormal unemployment rate. Then, when viewed in Table 2, which the researcher described in the background section, job seekers placed in Padang City are not balanced with registered job seekers. From 2021 to 2023, the number of registered job seekers is 12,614, while the labor placement is only 2,140. Thus, 10,474 job seekers are still unemployed.

Based on the explanation above, the researcher concludes that policy implementers generally have the same understanding and interpretation regarding policy goals and objectives. From several statements that researchers found, the purpose of this program is to place workers in positions that are under the qualifications of expertise, skills, interests, talents, and abilities with the target of reducing the unemployment rate in Padang City as regulated and explained in detail in the Minister of Manpower Regulation Number 39 of 2016 concerning Manpower Placement and in the LAKIP of the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office in 2023. However, when looking at the data obtained by researchers from the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office, the placement is still not balanced with job seekers registered in Padang City. So, suppose it is related to the theory of Van Meter and Van Horn (1975). However, the goals and objectives of this workforce placement program have been explained in the reality of policy regulations. In that case, these goals are still not maximally achieved.

Resources

The success of the implementation stage depends on the implementor's ability to utilize available resources (Agustino, 2020). Resources are reliable policy managers and provide quality facilities and infrastructure that apply science and technology to the maximum to achieve the policy's objectives (Herman, 2015). Based on the Regulation of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia Number 1 of 2020 concerning Guidelines for Position Analysis and Workload Analysis, the quantity of human resources needed at the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office, especially in the field of placement and expansion of employment opportunities, is as follows:

Table 4. Position Analysis of Employees of the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office in the Field of Placement and Expansion of Employment Opportunities

No.	Position	Ideal Situation	(Employee Supply)
1.	Head of Field	1	1
2.	Policy Technical Reviewer	3	2
3.	Data and Information Processor	3	0
4.	Intermediate Work Introduction	2	2
5.	Junior Job Introduction	4	2
6.	First Job Introduction	6	1
Total		19	8

Source: Padang City Manpower and Industry Office, Researcher processed results (2024)

Based on Table 4, it can be concluded that there is still a lack of quantity of employees in the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office with the results of position analysis, especially in the field of placement and expansion of employment opportunities. Humans are the most critical resource in determining the success of the implementation process (Agustino, 2020). The shortage of employees is one of the reasons why the implementation of the labor placement program in Padang City has not run optimally.

Apart from human resources, non-human resources also play an essential role in policy implementation. These non-human resources include budget resources and physical facilities and infrastructure. In implementing the workforce placement program, the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office must search for job vacancies by visiting employers directly. In searching for job vacancies, the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office experienced obstacles in the form of the limited budget provided. This can be seen from the results of the researcher's interview with a young expert in the field of placement and expansion of employment opportunities at the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office as follows:

"For this program, we also have the most significant obstacle, namely limitations in terms of budget. To socialize and search for job vacancies for employers in Padang City is done by visiting the employers directly. So, it takes a large part of the budget, mainly to cover the official travel order (SPPD) from the government in the region. The SPPD has been eliminated, and we are currently using the job introduction allowance only. So, it is pretty difficult for us to socialize in this program. The only other alternative is to contact employers online. And that, in my opinion, is not optimal." (Interview on 29 May 2024)

Furthermore, non-human resources that contribute to the success of this labor placement program include the availability of adequate facilities and infrastructure to support its implementation, such as the provision of comfortable service areas for job seekers to obtain AK 1 cards (job seeker identification cards issued by the Manpower Office), computers with robust network connections for online AK 1

card processing and printing, and appropriate transportation facilities for visiting employer companies. Regarding this matter, the researcher interviewed an intermediate expert in the field of placement and expansion of employment opportunities at the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office, as follows:

“For facilities and infrastructure, in this case, we already have a comfortable AK 1 card-making service room equipped with air conditioning and waiting chairs for job seekers. Vehicles are also provided from the office to go directly to employers. However, there are still shortcomings in computers and printers that only function sometimes. So, if many job seekers come to make AK 1 cards, we will be overwhelmed by the computers and printers available.” (Interview on 29 May 2024)

Based on the aforementioned analysis, the researcher concludes that the indicators of non-human resources in supporting policy implementation remain suboptimal, thereby impeding the implementation of the labor placement program in Padang City.

Characteristics of Implementing Agents

Bureaucratic structure

In implementing the workforce placement program, the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office acts as an agency that has the authority supported by an effective bureaucratic structure and not too long span of control. The head of the office directly supervises each head of the field, and each head also directly supervises the functional positions in each field. For the manpower placement program, the field responsible for the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office is the field of placement and expansion of employment opportunities.

In the workforce placement program, several services involve parties outside the agency. The service is in the form of making job seeker cards (AK 1) directly related to job seekers in Padang City to reporting job vacancy information by employers in Padang City. The existence of this unique field can facilitate job seekers and employers who will carry out services in the workforce placement program at the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office. This is per the researcher's interview with job seekers in Padang City as follows:

“When making the AK 1 card, the security guard immediately directed me to go to a room, and the officer there immediately helped me by explaining the procedure for making this AK 1 card. So I did not have to bother to find out where the AK 1 service was.” (Interview on 29 July 2024)

Based on the interview above, it can be seen that the existence of a unique field responsible for the workforce placement program at the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office, namely the field of placement and expansion of employment opportunities, makes the services provided to job seekers and employers more effective so that can facilitate the implementation of the workforce placement program.

Norms

In implementing the workforce placement program, The Padang City Manpower and Industry Office, as the main implementor, follow the norms that apply in the institution. The norms that apply to the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office refer to the work culture of the Padang City government. This is under the researcher's interview with the head of the placement and expansion of employment opportunities at the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office as follows:

"There are no specific norms or rules in this program because the Minister of Manpower Regulation also does not regulate it. So, we just stick to the culture of the Padang City government." (Interview on 29 May 2024)

The work culture in question is as follows:

1. Collaboration, mutual respect, cooperation in goodness & preventing evil (Amar ma'ruf nahi munkar).
2. Empathy, namely serving, dialogue, responsiveness, friendliness
3. Professional, namely discipline, independence, initiative, lifelong learning
4. Integrity, i.e., religious, trustworthy, honest, exemplary, transparency
5. Innovation, namely getting out of the comfort zone, generating new ideas, being open, broad-minded/international.

Based on the work culture above, researchers conducted interviews with employees in the field of placement and expansion of employment opportunities at the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office as follows:

"The work culture in this office is the same as the work culture in general. We enter the office at 07.30 and finish at 16.00 WIB. Then, we periodically receive coaching and training from the Ministry of Manpower related to improving the quality of human resources when running existing programs. So, even after working here, we are still learning to provide maximum performance later. In addition, in providing services to the community and employers, we always try to provide friendly and responsive services related to the issues needed by both the community and employers. responsive regarding the issues needed by both job seekers and employers." (Interview on 29 May 2024)

Based on the explanation above, it can be concluded that in the implementation of the workforce placement program at the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office, the employees at the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office are

The work culture of the Padang City government guides the employees at the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office. The prevailing work culture can be a guideline in running the workforce placement program; the prevailing culture also does not hinder the program's running.

Patterns of Bureaucratic Relations

The working relationships within the organizations involved will influence policy implementation. The relationship pattern that occurs during the

implementation of the workforce placement program at the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office can be seen from the communication process and the dissemination of information that occurs during the program's implementation. Regarding this matter. The researcher interviewed with the Head of the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office as follows:

"In running every program in this agency, we always hold regular meetings at least once a week. In the meeting, we evaluate the programs we have run and discuss future planning for the programs here." (Interview on 31 July 2024)

Based on the results of the above interview, it can be seen that communication carried out within the internal environment of the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office runs routinely, as seen from the regular meetings held between the head of the office and the head of the field at least once a week. This routine meeting serves as a forum for program evaluation and planning. Program planning. Problems or obstacles in implementation, such as the lack of socialization of job vacancies, can be identified and resolved. The meeting will also discuss labor placement strategies that meet the company's needs to accelerate filling job vacancies and reduce the unemployment rate. Job vacancies and reduce the Open Unemployment Rate in Padang City.

Furthermore, in the manpower placement program, the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office also receive coaching and training from the Ministry of Manpower of the Republic of Indonesia. This is done once to twice a year by the Ministry of Manpower of the Republic of Indonesia to improve the quality of human resources and implement the workforce placement program.

Based on the explanation above, it can be concluded that the pattern of bureaucratic relations found in the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office in implementing this workforce placement program has gone well. This can be seen from the weekly routine meeting between the head of the office and the head of the field. The Padang City Manpower and Industry Office also gets regular socialization and coaching once or twice a year from the Ministry of Manpower of the Republic of Indonesia to improve the quality of human resources to implement the workforce placement program.

Attitudes and Dispositions of Implementers

The implementor's response to the policy will affect their ability to implement it. The attitude of implementors in implementing the workforce placement program at the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office will align with its implementation. In the implementation of the manpower placement program at the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office, the implementor's response can be in line with its implementation. In the implementation of the workforce placement program at the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office, the implementor's response can be seen from the response of employees of the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office, especially in the field of placement and expansion of employment opportunities. Related to this, the researcher interviewed the Head of the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office as follows:

“Because this comes from the center, we have to support it. Moreover, if you look at the unemployment rate in Padang City, it is quite alarming because it is the highest in West Sumatra. The existence of this program is one of the efforts that we can make as a regional apparatus in the field of employment to reduce the unemployment rate.”
(Interview on 31 July 2024)

It can be concluded that the program implementor, namely the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office, tends to agree with and support the worker placement program at the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office. However, this program has not been well-socialized by employer companies. According to the researcher's analysis, the agreement of the implementers occurs because the regulation clearly states that the purpose of this program is to place the workers in appropriate positions, which will later affect the unemployment rate in Padang City.

In this case, it refers to the implementor's tendency towards a value to determine the choice in implementing the policy. Value preferences are related to the implementor's belief in what is received from a policy. According to Festinger in Van Meter and Van Horn (1975), implementors can try to balance unpleasant policies with their perceptions of how the policy should be. Related to this, the researcher obtained the following information:

“I think this labor placement program is very good because it aims directly to reduce unemployment in Padang City, but it would be nice to have a special regulation in Padang City that regulates this placement in detail. Later, it can be adjusted to the conditions here. Because for now, it still uses the Minister of Manpower Regulation, which is still too general.” (Interview on 29 May 2024)

Based on the information obtained from the interview excerpts above, it can be concluded that there are similarities in the acceptance of this labor placement program. The informants that the researchers interviewed have generally supported the program. However, as implementers, they still have other perceptions to improve the program's shortcomings, namely the existence of special rules in the region that discuss the labor placement program in Padang City. Padang City. The existence of this special regulation in Padang City can improve the implementation of the labor placement program by adjusting the policy based on the specific needs of the region, such as the characteristics of the workforce and the potential of the local economy so that it is more relevant than the national policy. In addition, the special regulation strengthens coordination between the agency, companies, and job seekers and provides a stricter supervision mechanism to monitor the program's success. The special regulation can also provide incentives to companies supporting the program, such as providing employment opportunities to local workers or training. On the other hand, this special regulation also encourages structured socialization and training to increase community participation, help prepare job seekers according to market needs, and reduce unemployment. These additional regulations are expected to improve the implementation of the labor placement program in Padang City.

Communication and coordination between organizations and event organizers

Inter-organizational communication is complex and challenging because communicators may intentionally or unintentionally distort the information when delivering it. Communication is a form of administrative work relationship that supports coordination. Coordination is intended to unite the activities of the organization's work units so that the organization moves as a unified whole. The organization moves as a unified unit to carry out all organizational tasks to achieve its goals (Regina et al., 2020). For all implementors to understand the program's contents and objectives, it is necessary to socialize policies for all implementors who will implement the policy. Socialization aims to communicate the aims and objectives of the policy so that the implementors involved do not have different interpretations and the policy can be adequately achieved. The implementation of the worker placement program involves employers in Padang City. Regarding this, the researcher interviewed a young expert job introducer at the Padang City Labour and Industry Office as follows:

“Our communication with employers is done directly to their companies and online. So, if there is information about job vacancies, we will visit the company and confirm the vacancy. If it is true, then the agency will record the job vacancy information and will return to the company at least once a month to monitor and request data related to the placement of workers that has been carried out. However, we have not visited all employers in Padang City due to the agency's limited human resources.” (Interview on 29 May 2024)

Based on the explanation above, the researcher concluded that the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office has communicated with employers in Padang City. Communication is carried out with employers by going directly to the company and also online. If there is information on job vacancies, the agency will visit the company and confirm the vacancy. If it is true, then the agency will record the job vacancy information and will return to the company at least once a month to monitor and request data related to the placement of workers that has been carried out. However, communication has not been made to all employers because there are limited human resources in the Padang City Labour and Industry Office to go directly to employer companies.

Social, economic, and political conditions

When looking at the community's response to the workforce placement program carried out by the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office, this can be proven by the enthusiasm of the community at the job fair activities carried out by the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office on 25 and 26 October 2023. Job fairs are an effort by the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office to bring together job seekers with employers in large numbers. Simultaneously, in large numbers. This job fair was held at the Youth Centre of Padang City and was carried out online and offline. The job fair activities carried out by the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office were attended by 80 companies that participated and provided job vacancies online and offline. Based on data from the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office, there were 2,424 job vacancies available at this Job Fair, with 186

job positions and business fields available. The number of job seekers who attended offline was 5,878, and those who attended online were 2,889.

However, based on the job fair activities that have been held previously, there is still an imbalance between registered job seekers and job seekers who get jobs. This is because the lack of competence possessed by job seekers with the need for job vacancies is also the leading cause of many job seekers who have not yet found a job. Regarding this, the researcher interviewed with the Head of the Padang City Labour and Industry Office as follows:

“Actually, for this program, there are still many job seekers who have not found jobs because the competence of job seekers themselves is still not qualified. In this day and age, employers generally ask for job seekers who have a certificate of competence. Meanwhile, many companies do not want to spend much money to conduct their own training. So job seekers are asked to already have a certificate of competence as a condition of applying for a job.” (Interview on 31 July 2024)

Although the enthusiasm of job seekers is high, if it still does not meet the demands of employers, then the placement still cannot be done. In addition, employers are rarely willing to organize their own training for job seekers. They require job seekers to have a certificate of competence before applying for the job.

The economic condition of Padang City, as the capital of West Sumatra Province, reflects the dynamism of leading sectors such as trade, tourism, and manufacturing industries. The city is experiencing steady economic growth, fuelled by a rapidly growing service sector, particularly in trade and tourism, contributing significantly to the Gross Regional Domestic Product (GRDP). GRDP data shows that the trade and tourism sectors are the main drivers of Padang City's economy, with contributions increasing yearly. The following is the growth rate of the 2010 series GRDP by the business field for 2021-2023:

Table 5. Growth Rate of 2010 Series GRDP by Business Field for 2021-2023

Business Field Category	Growth Rate of 2010 Series GRDP by Business Field (Percent)		
	2021	2022	2023
Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries	1,28	2,33	3,93
Mining and Quarrying	3,84	3,29	4,44
Processing Industry	1,06	0,42	0,74
Electricity and Gas Procurement	0,61	3,49	4,61
Water Procurement, Waste Management, Waste and Recycling	4,74	1,77	3,05
Construction	1,27	4,84	6,68

Business Field Category	Growth Rate of 2010 Series GRDP by Business Field (Percent)		
	2021	2022	2023
Wholesale and Retail Trade; Repair of Cars and Motorcycles	6,32	7,06	4,98
Transport and Warehousing	3,13	3,39	4,90
Provision of Accommodation and Drinking Food	6,03	15,64	8,54
Information and Communication	6,03	7,12	7,55
Financial and Insurance Services	9,65	3,39	0,55
Real Estate	2,39	5,73	6,51
Corporate Services	0,99	6,39	6,47
Public Administration, Defence and Compulsory Social Security	0,57	-0,91	2,65
Education Services	1,66	2,68	1,72
Health and Social Services	5,83	4,50	7,15
Other Services	7,22	12,08	7,56
Gross Regional Domestic Product	3,65	4,31	4,54

Source: Central Bureau of Statistics of Padang City, 2024

Based on the table above, it can be seen that the sectors that contribute the most to the economy of Padang City are wholesale and retail trade and accommodation and food services. The wholesale and retail trade sectors are the primary drivers because Padang City is the center of trade in West Sumatra Province, with many markets, shops, and shopping centers supporting the distribution of goods and services. In addition, the accommodation services sector, which includes hotels, lodges, and food providers, plays an essential role in supporting Padang City's growing tourism sector. With many tourists visiting the city, this sector continues to grow and contributes significantly to the GRDP of Padang City. These two sectors, trade and tourism, support each other and form the backbone of the city's economy, creating jobs and driving sustainable economic growth. This condition creates opportunities for developing these sectors, which require skilled labor in the hospitality, transportation, and trade sectors. Therefore, implementing the workforce placement program in Kota Padang must be tailored to the needs of these dominant sectors. An effective workforce placement program will direct local labor to fill positions in the growing sectors, improve the quality of human resources, and reduce unemployment. Thus, the GDRP of Padang City, which shows good economic growth, must be balanced with a labor placement program that can

provide skilled labor by market demand to support the city's economic development sustainability and equity.

In the labor placement program at the Manpower and Industry Office of Padang City, support from the political elite is also very important. Support from the political elite can be seen in the political elite's response in supporting the implementation of this program. Political elites are a small group with great power and influence in political decision-making. This group comprises individuals with strategic positions, such as government officials, politicians, political party leaders, business figures, academics, and other influential groups. Political elites have greater access to resources, information, and power networks that enable them to influence a country's policies and political direction (Burnham, 2001).

Political elites in the implementation of the labor placement program at the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office are very important because political elites have a significant influence on policy making, resource allocation, and supervision of program implementation. This was revealed under the results of the researcher's interview with the Head of the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office as follows:

“Regarding political support from the Padang City government in this workforce placement program, we have received a lot, namely from the Padang City Regional Regulation Number 2 of 2021 concerning the implementation of employment. In this local regulation, there is a discussion about labor placement.” (Interview on 29 July 2024)

Based on the interview results above, it can be concluded that there has been support from the political elite in this workforce placement program in the form of the issuance of Padang City Regional Regulation Number 2 of 2021 concerning employment services. In this regulation, there is a discussion on labor placement. However, when examined in more detail, the discussion on workforce placement in the regulation still cannot be used as a reference in running the program because it is still general and not adjusted to the employment conditions in Padang City. This is because this regulation summarises all central employment regulations into one contained in the Padang City Regional Regulation No. 2 of 2021 concerning Employment Services. Thus, although a regional regulation has already discussed the placement of workers, the Padang City Manpower and Industry Office still uses Minister of Manpower Regulation No. 39/2016 on Manpower Placement as a reference in implementing the program.

Discussion: A Non-Western Public Administration Perspective on Employment Policy Implementation in Padang City

Implementing the employment placement program in Padang City offers an illustrative case for understanding public policy within a Non-Western Public Administration framework. Central to this perspective is the importance of cultural, political, and socio-economic contexts that shape administrative processes in non-Western societies, often in ways that diverge from Western-centric theoretical frameworks. Drawing upon the findings presented, several critical elements

underscore the complexities and challenges the Dinas Tenaga Kerja dan Perindustrian Kota Padang faces in achieving its stated objectives.

Firstly, the focus on aligning local conditions with national policy directives exemplifies the tension between centralization and local autonomy, a recurring theme in non-Western administrative contexts (Farazmand, 2009). While the program follows guidelines from Minister of Manpower Regulation No. 39 of 2016, the data suggests that its general applicability fails to adequately address the unique socio-economic realities of Padang, such as the high unemployment rate and mismatch between job seeker qualifications and labor market demands. This highlights the need for locally tailored regulatory frameworks that integrate regional labor characteristics with economic opportunities, a strategy increasingly advocated in adaptive public administration practices in the Global South (Cheema & Rondinelli, 2007).

Moreover, the role of limited resources, both human and financial, underscores a systemic challenge prevalent in many non-Western bureaucracies, where resource scarcity often hinders policy implementation (Haque, 2001). The analysis of staffing deficits within key operational units, coupled with inadequate technological infrastructure, suggests an overburdened administrative capacity yet expected to deliver ambitious policy goals. This aligns with critiques of resource dependency in non-Western public administration, which emphasize how external and internal resource constraints compromise service delivery (Dwivedi & Jabbara, 1988). Addressing these gaps requires increased allocations and innovative governance models, such as public-private partnerships, to amplify resource mobilization and service effectiveness.

The cultural dimensions of administrative behavior and organizational norms further complicate policy implementation. The adherence to values like empathy, professionalism, and integrity, as highlighted in the findings, reflects a localized interpretation of bureaucratic ethics grounded in the socio-cultural fabric of Padang. However, such normative frameworks must contend with practical challenges, such as limited coordination with employers and insufficient outreach, that undermine the program's effectiveness. This illustrates the dual-edged nature of cultural factors in non-Western administration, where deeply embedded social norms can facilitate and constrain policy outcomes (Ehsan et al., 2018).

The interplay between political support and administrative accountability is another critical factor. The findings reveal that while the program benefits from broad political endorsement, the lack of precise and enforceable local regulations dilutes the program's capacity to effectively respond to Padang's labor market dynamics. This echoes concerns raised in non-Western public administration literature about the reliance on elite-driven policy frameworks that often prioritize symbolic compliance with national policies over substantive local innovation (Painter & Peters, 2010). Enhancing program outcomes necessitates reconfiguring policy instruments to include localized, context-sensitive regulations that are co-created with stakeholders, including employers and job seekers.

Finally, the economic context of Padang, with its reliance on sectors such as trade and tourism, provides an opportunity to align employment placement programs with the city's development trajectory. However, the findings point to a misalignment between labor supply and demand, exacerbated by the lack of skill development initiatives for job seekers. This underscores the importance of incorporating sector-specific workforce development strategies into public administration, ensuring that programs address unemployment and the qualitative dimensions of labor market participation (Joshi, 2021).

In conclusion, the employment placement program in Padang City illustrates the multifaceted challenges of policy implementation in non-Western contexts, where cultural, political, and resource dynamics converge to shape administrative outcomes. To enhance its effectiveness, there is a need for more localized policy frameworks, innovative resource strategies, and stronger coordination mechanisms that resonate with Padang's unique socio-economic landscape. This case contributes to broader discussions in non-Western Public Administration by demonstrating the importance of context-sensitive approaches that balance national directives with local realities.

Conclusion

Based on the research results analyzed using the implementation theory variables by Van Meter and Van Horn, it is found that the results of this study conclude that the Implementation of the Manpower Placement Program in Padang City is still not maximally implemented because the objectives to be achieved from the policy have not been fully met. This research provides a new understanding of implementing the labor placement program in Padang City, which still refers to national policies. It highlights the importance of developing more specific local regulations to respond to labor market dynamics at the city level. It explores how the reliance on national policies impacts the effectiveness of program implementation and provides recommendations regarding possible policy adjustments at the local level. The novelty of this research lies in the comparative analysis between the implementation of national policy-based labor placement policies and the need for local policy development in Padang City. While many other regions already have local regulations related to employment, Padang City still relies on national policies that lack flexibility in accommodating the unique employment challenges at the city level. The findings of this research are important for developing labor policies in Padang City, as it provides a solid basis for policymakers to consider implementing more contextualized local regulations. The research allows the city government to adopt its job placement program to be more responsive to local labor market needs and socio-economic challenges.

Based on the conclusions of the research on implementing the workforce placement program at the Manpower and Industry Office of Padang City described above, suggestions can be made that are expected to improve the implementation of this program. The Padang City Manpower and Industry Office can increase the capacity and competence of human resources for employees, as well as improve

work procedures and facilities to support the implementation of the workforce placement program. In addition, improving job vacancy information services through various media, both in person and online, can help job seekers gain easier access to available job opportunities. The Office can also strengthen monitoring of job vacancies and placements in companies in Kota Padang and increase socialization with companies regarding the obligation to report job vacancies and placements to the relevant agencies. Better communication and coordination with private labor placement agencies (LPTKS) are needed to expedite the labor placement process and create practical cooperation. In addition, the Padang City Government can design special regulations regarding labor placement that align with the employment conditions in Padang City so that the policies implemented can run more optimally and provide benefits for job seekers and the business world.

This research has several limitations that may affect the results and conclusions obtained. The scope of the study, which only focuses on Padang City, means that the results cannot be generalized to other regions with different employment conditions. In addition, limitations in collecting primary data, especially from the private sector, mean that the analysis does not reflect the industry's perspective as labor users. The study's relatively short duration is also an obstacle in looking at the program's long-term impact. In addition, this study focuses more on the implementation process without measuring the program's effectiveness in reducing unemployment or improving the welfare of the workforce.

To overcome these limitations, future research could expand the coverage area by comparing program implementation in several regions to get a more comprehensive picture. In addition, future research could involve more parties, including the private sector and labor, to understand the challenges and opportunities from various perspectives. Regulatory analyses and comparisons with best practices in other regions or countries can also provide insights into more effective policies. The study of social and cultural factors, infrastructure readiness, and innovative strategies in labor placement, such as digitalization and cooperation with the industrial sector, could also be the focus of future research to optimize the labor placement program and match the needs of the labor market.

References

- Agustino, Leo. (2020). *Dasar-Dasar Kebijakan Publik*. Bandung: Alfabeta
- Anggara, Sahya. (2018). *Kebijakan Publik*. Bandung Pustaka Setia
- Aurich-Berheide, P., Catalano, S. L., Graziano, P. R., & Zimmermann, K. (2015). Stakeholder participation and policy integration in local social and employment policies: Germany and Italy compared. *Journal of European Social Policy*, 25(4), 379–392
- Burnham, P. (2001). *Introduction to Politics*. London: Palgrave.
- Barbăneagră, O., & Jomir, E. (2024). Unemployment Challenges in the Republic of Moldova: Analysis of Trends and Countermeasures. *Economica*, 3(129), 79–94.
- Central Bureau of Statistics Padang City (2024) GRDP Growth Rate Series 2010 According to Business Field. Accessed on January 20, 2025

- Central Bureau of Statistics of West Sumatra. (2023). Open Unemployment Rate by Regency/City (Percent) 2021-2023.
- Cheema, G. S., & Rondinelli, D. A. (2007). *Decentralizing Governance: Emerging Concepts and Practices*. Brookings Institution Press.
- Dwivedi, O. P., & Jabbra, J. G. (1988). Public service accountability: A comparative perspective. *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, 54(1), 83-96.
- Dye, Thomas R. (2008) *Understanding Public Policy*, New Jersey: Prentice Hall
- Ehsan, M., Naz, R., & Khan, A. (2018). Administrative Ethics in the Developing World. *Public Integrity*, 20(4), 406-418.
- Edlmann, F. R. P., & Grobbelaar, S. S. (2021). A Framework of Engagement Practices for Stakeholders Collaborating around Complex Social Challenges. *Sustainability*, 13(19), 10828.
- Farazmand, A. (2009). Building administrative capacity for the age of rapid globalization: A modest prescription for the twenty-first century. *Public Administration Review*, 69(6), 1007-1020.
- Gibbs, D., Jonas, A. E. G., Reimer, S., & Spooner, D. (2001). Governance, institutional capacity and partnerships in local economic development: theoretical issues and empirical evidence from the Humber Sub-region. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, 26(1), 103-119
- Haque, M. S. (2001). The Diminishing Publicness of Public Service under the Current Mode of Governance. *Public Administration Review*, 61(1), 65-82.
- Haris, A., Anas, A., Nurjaya, M., Iriawan, H., & Abdullah, M. T. (2024). Strategi dan Implementasi Kebijakan Program Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) untuk Pengentasan Kemiskinan di Desa. *Jurnal Analisis Kebijakan & Pelayanan Publik*, 10(1): 65-78.
- Herman, H. (2015). Implementasi Program Indonesia Emas Pada Kementerian Pemuda Dan Olahraga Republik Indonesia. *Jurnal Analisis Kebijakan & Pelayanan Publik*, 1(1)" 98-107.
- Howlett, M., & Ramesh, M. (2022). Designing for Adaptation: Static and Dynamic Robustness in Policy Making. *Public Administration*, 101(1), 23-35.
- Indiahono, Dwiyanto. (2017). *Kebijakan Publik Berbasis Dynamic Policy Analysis*. Yogyakarta: Gava Media
- Iva, M. I. N. (2015). Implementasi Kebijakan Jaminan Kesehatan Nasional Melalui Badan Penyelenggara Jaminan Sosial (BPJS) Kesehatan Di Kota Makassar. *Jurnal Analisis Kebijakan & Pelayanan Publik*, 1(2): 149-157.
- Joshi, A. (2021). Workforce Development in Emerging Economies. *Development in Practice*, 31(3): 345-358.
- Mardalis. (2010). *Metode Penelitian suatu Pendekatan Proposal*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara
- Moleong, J Lexy. (2009). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosdakary
- Ministry of Manpower Republic of Indonesia (2016) Regulation of the Minister of Manpower Number 39 of 2016 Concerning Placement of Workers
- Ministry of State Apparatus Empowerment and Bureaucratic Reform, Republic of Indonesia (2016) Regulation of the Minister of State Apparatus Empowerment and Bureaucratic Reform of the Republic of Indonesia Number 1 of 2020 concerning Guidelines for Job Analysis and Workload Analysis

- Nasri, M. (2021). *Implementasi Peraturan Daerah Kabupaten Rokan Hulu Nomor 9 Tahun 2017 tentang Pemberdayaan dan Penempatan Tenaga Kerja Lokal (Studi Pada Kecamatan Kunto Darussalam)* (Doctoral dissertation, Universitas Islam Riau).
- Nugroho, Riant. (2014). *Public Policy*. Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo.
- Painter, M., & Peters, B. G. (2010). *Tradition and Public Administration*. Springer.
- Polman, D., Polman, D., & Alons, G. C. (2021). Reap what you sow: implementing agencies as strategic actors in policy feedback dynamics. *Policy Sciences*, 54(4), 1-26.
- Putra, M. A. P. (2022). *Implementasi Peraturan Daerah Kota Pekanbaru Nomor 13 Tahun 2018 Tentang Perubahan Atas Peraturan Daerah Nomor 4 Tahun 2002 Tentang Penempatan Tenaga Kerja Lokal*. (Skripsi Universitas Andalas, Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik)
- Regina, R., Rusli, B., & Candradewini, C. (2020). Koordinasi Pengembangan Program Kampung Keluarga Berencana di Kabupaten Bangka Barat. *JAKPP (Jurnal Analisis Kebijakan & Pelayanan Publik)*, 65-85.
- Sari, G. P., & Devy, T. (2023). Pengaruh Pertumbuhan Ekonomi Dan Inflasi Terhadap Tingkat Pengangguran Di Sumatera Barat. *Inisiatif: Jurnal Ekonomi, Akuntansi dan Manajemen*, 2(4), 481-495.
- Shahriar, K., & Khan, A. R. (2016). A Critical Insight into Policy Implementation and Implementation Performance. *Public Policy and Administration*, 15(4), 538-548
- Sifa, Nurul and Nurfahmiyati. (2022). *Pengaruh Jumlah Penduduk, Inflasi dan Kemiskinan Terhadap Pengangguran di Sumatera Barat*. Bandung Conference Series: Economics Studies. Vol. 02. No 1.
- Soleh, A. (2017). Masalah ketenagakerjaan dan pengangguran di Indonesia. *Jurnal Ilmiah Cano Ekonomos*, 6(2), 83-92.
- Subarsono. (2022). *Analisis Kebijakan Publik: Konsep, Teori dan Aplikasi*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar
- Sugiyono. (2021). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif Kualitatif dan R&D*. Bandung: Alfabeta
- Suyitno. (2018). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif Konsep, Prinsip dan Operasionalnya*. Tulugagung: Akademia Pustaka
- Van Horn, Carl E., dan Donald S. Van Meter. (1975). *The Policy Implementation Process: A Conceptual Framework*. New York: Sage
- Winarno, Budi. (2012). *Kebijakan Publik (Teori, Proses dan Studi Kasus)*. Jakarta: Buku Seru