The Effectiveness of Online Coaching Through Social Networking Site 
(A case study of Coach Potato Indonesia)

Siti Mahdaria1*, Titus Angga Restuaji2

1Universitas Islam Indonesia, Indonesia
2Santo Fransiskus Foundation Jakarta, Indonesia
*Correspondence: smahdaria@gmail.com

ABSTRACT
In the more globalized world, social networking sites are used to connect people and popular as a learning platform. More people use webinars to talk about specific topics through a social network. The number of online courses raise and change the way people learn. People used to study in a classroom with a tutor in front of them, but now people only need to sit in front of a screen to learn new things. However, the effectiveness of this process is still questioned. Therefore, this study aims to analyse the effectiveness of online coaching through a social networking site and the critical challenge in online coaching and approach to tackle it. This study is qualitative research. The data is collected from online interviews with a semi-structured interview guide. The sample of the study is 12 mentees and 5 mentors who had been involved in 12 weeks of online scholarship coaching held by Coach Potato Indonesia. The data is analyzed using a thematic content method, and the effectiveness of online coaching is measured by using the Kirkpatrick Model. The result of the study is that online mentoring through social networking sites is effective and efficient, especially in particular related to geographical and financial issues. The authors found the critical challenges in online mentoring are internet connection and timing. Therefore, online mentoring should use multiple platforms to adjust with the technical issue that might occur.

1. Introduction

Currently, the 4.0 industrial revolution has been a hot issue around the globe, including Indonesia. People put attention to this topic in political discussion, student symposium, and even TV news. According to Senvar and Akkartal (2018), industry 4.0 has started developing information and communication technologies. It led to the growth of online activities. Ribbers and Waringa (2015) explain in their research that people on average spend 23.8 hours online every month. People in North America spend 37.2 hours, Europe 26.8 hours, and Asia Pacific 17.2 hours and those numbers will keep increasing. In addition, they also mentioned that in 2015 there were 35 billion devices connected to the internet, which includes computers, tablets, and smartphones. This number continues to increase. It means that getting more opportunities from an online platform is higher since everybody connects to the internet. Following Ribbers and Waringa (2015) assertions that e-coaching is an innovative solution to the rapid change in the world.

The improvement of technology and the development of industry 4.0 are shifting the way people communicate and learn from face-to-face to online (Rahman & Amir, 2019). This development brings innovation to education by the implementation of a new learning process beyond traditional practice (Ellahi 2018). Online learning is rapidly rising at universities (Bettinger et al, 2017) and will be used more in formal education and professional development programs (Thurlings et al., 2014). Furthermore, people also shift from using ‘informational websites’ to social media sites where people can interact and discuss. More people prefer to use social media websites as a learning platform, which is ubiquitous. Data shows that the number of users utilizing social media websites for learning reached 1.79 billion in 2016 (Darginavičienė & Navickienė 2016).
Along with the digital revolution, the popularity of online classes has risen. A research conducted by Song, Kim and Luo (2015) found that there(100,143),(892,324) is a growing interest in having online courses among college students. Moreover, the study by Alfonzo (2019) shows that the use of social media to communicate is also popular among librarians. Hence, the education sector witnesses the growing importance of online platforms for learning to keep up with the advancement of the digital revolution.

The use of social networking sites (SNS) for online courses has received recognition from people. SNS is an online platform where users can create a profile and interact with other users, and new users can search the networks of connection. SNS is also well-known as a social networking website or social website (Techopedia, 2019). According to Ellahi (2018), SNS is the most common platform used to make real-time online interactions with friends, family, students, and teachers. Some of the examples of the SNS are Facebook, LinkedIn, Ning, Cyworld, MySpace, Google+ (Romero, 2015). Furthermore, research conducted by Alfonzo (2019) describes how librarians used Snapchat and Instagram to share video content and communicate with teenagers and young adults. Hence, Ribbers and Waringa (2015) conclude that electronic coaching is an innovation in coaching that gains more popularity.

In response to that, a new social enterprise was established at the end of 2018, called Coach Potato Indonesia (CPI). CPI focuses on youth empowerment by providing capacity-building programs through coaching, mentoring, and workshops. The vision of CPI is to transform young people in Indonesia to be determined, confident, and independent in order for them to be able to contribute to the nation. Accordingly, the first project of CPI was an online scholarship coaching to help Indonesian youth get a global educational experience. Considering the mentors spread around Australia, Turkey, and Thailand, while the mentees are in Indonesia, CPI used SNS for the coaching program. After 12 weeks of online coaching, some of the mentees got the scholarship they applied for. However, many of the mentees have not received any scholarships. This situation convinces the researchers that it is crucial to analyze the significance of the coaching program in terms of helping the mentees prepare scholarship applications.

The experience of conducting an online coaching program also informs the researchers that having an online class through a webinar is uncommon. People used to study in a class with a teacher right in front of them, then people nowadays are learning through their screen. However, the effectiveness of this process is still questionable. Bettinger et al (2017) found in their research that “online courses are not yet as effective as in-person courses.” Furthermore, Kinash, Knight, and McLean (2015) also argue that having lectures online or offline will not affect students’ achievement. Therefore, this study aims to analyse the effectiveness of online coaching through a social networking site, the more preferable platform for OC, the challenges in online coaching, and how to tackle it.

2. Methodology

This research was conducted with the cooperation of CPI by using a qualitative research method. Bryman (2016) said that qualitative research is used to analyse participants’ experience, view, and belief. The data was collected from an online interview to 12 mentees and 5 mentors of a scholarship coaching program from CPI with a semi-structured interview guide. The aim is to understand their perspective regarding the effectiveness of OC through SNS. Bryman (2016), mentioned that semi-structured interviews are a flexible approach that is proper for unanticipated responses. The sample size is active mentees and mentors who have participated in the 12-week scholarship coaching program. The sample size was measured by the number of active participants involved in the program. The 17 samples were given an online form to fill out, then the interview from WhatsApp was conducted for further information.

CPI opened recruitment to select the mentees for scholarship coaching. The purpose of the coaching was to train young people in Indonesia to pursue a global educational experience, including exchange programs, international conferences, and scholarships for a master degree. There were only 15 mentees who got accepted from 54 applicants who went through the selection process — however, only 12 mentees who actively engage with the program. The mentees are from various regions in Indonesia, including Pali in South Sumatra, Kerinci in Jambi, Yogyakarta, Jakarta, Bogor, Bandung, and Pare in Kediri. Meanwhile, some mentors are staying abroad, in Australia and Thailand. Therefore, this study was conducted both in Melbourne, Australia and South Sumatra, Indonesia.

The transcripts from the online form and the phone call were analysed by thematic content method. Thematic analysis is the process of identifying patterns or themes within qualitative data’ (Maguire & Delahunt 2017). The researchers started by familiarising the data. Then the researchers generated initial codes for each item of the interview questions, created themes of each question category, and defined the connection among the themes. Furthermore the effectiveness of the online coaching was analysed by using the Kirkpatrick Model. The Kirkpatrick Model is commonly used to analyse the effectiveness of a program with four levels of assessments. Kirkpatrick and Kirkpatrick (2006) set four
criteria for a program evaluation: reaction, learning, behavior, and results. A study by Praslova (2010) also shows the effectiveness of the Kirkpatrick Model in assessing students' performance in a higher education setting.

3. Results

Findings reveal how effective online coaching is through various networking sites and what are the challenges in online coaching and how mentees and mentors tackle the challenges. This study classified the theme into three; online coaching, social networking site, and online coaching.

Table 1. Thematic content of the interview

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Codes</th>
<th>Basic Themes</th>
<th>Organising Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Interest in OC</td>
<td></td>
<td>Online coaching (OC)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience in OC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency of coaching</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Challenges in OC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Online VS offline coaching</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of SNS</td>
<td></td>
<td>Social networking site (SNS)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Challenges in OC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommended SNS for OC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>Level 1 Reaction</td>
<td>The effectiveness of online coaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engagement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevancy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-development</td>
<td>Level 2 Learning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant change</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning point</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefit from OC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Build characters</td>
<td>Level 3 Behaviour</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge implementation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outcomes</td>
<td>Level 4 Results</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expectation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Online Coaching

Based on an online interview, the researchers found mentees' perspective on online coaching with CPI. Two mentees have experienced online coaching from other institutions. They were courses on IELTS speaking and writing, augmented reality, and infographic making. Their previous experience with online coaching has benefited them. Thus, they decided to try online scholarship coaching with CPI. In line with the findings of Bettinger et al. (2017), online coaching is found to be sustainable and time-efficient for the course participants, or we call them "coachee". The other 10 mentees have their first online coaching experience with CPI.

The study finds the reason why mentees are interested in online coaching.

"It is flexible and accessible from anywhere as long as we have an internet connection," Fatima, a pseudonym, a female CPI mentee.

"OC is efficient since we can access the class just by sitting in our house or office without costing us any transportation fee to come to the class while connecting with mentors who are abroad," Rahman, a pseudonym, a male CPI mentee.
“Online coaching is an effective way to get direct and real-time feedback from peers and mentors,” Via, a pseudonym, a female CPI mentee.

Therefore, they can improve their skills, broaden their knowledge, and learn from each other through an online platform. A similar story has happened in Africa, a group of African audiences were empowered through a regular online seminar or well-known as a “webinar” to provide a convenient academic presentation that is accessible from anywhere while they were doing other works (Fadlelmola et al., 2019).

According to the mentees’ experience with online coaching provided by CPI, the program was challenging. It is because they have to be consistent to finish their weekly assignment and discuss their progress weekly. Although it seems challenging, they enjoy it, and they get a lot of insight about scholarship applications and essay writing.

“I need a support system. OC reminds me to learn, study, and keep sharing. I found lots of inspiration during the mentoring,” Putra, a pseudonym, a male CPI mentee.

“Online coaching gives me experience and knowledge about studying abroad. From the activities, we can learn something new,” Agus, a pseudonym, a male CPI mentee.

The majority of the respondents said that they always got inspired after the session because the mentors always went the extra mile to help and support them improve their skills and build their characters. By listening to the story of the mentors’ journey, the mentees became more confident and started to trust their process.

“The story from mentors’ experience has motivated me to be more confident,” Moli and Nuri, female, CPI mentee.

Agus states, “Interaction between mentee and mentor made me confident and be well prepared for my future.”.

“Coach Potato bisa membuat saya percaya diri karena motivasi nyata dari para mentor. Mereka berbagi valuensya dan prinsipnya dengan para mentee.”

“Coach Potato helps me grow my confidence, particularly through the motivation given by the mentors. The mentors happily shared their values and tenets in hunting the scholarships,” Fatih, female, CPI mentee.

In line with Grabt (2001) and Whitmore (1995) as cited in Stein et al. (2012), it is clear that there is a possibility of cognitive, emotional, and behavioural change through a coaching program since it unlocks the potential in a person. In addition to that, Thurlings et al. (2014) reveal that instructors strongly influence an online discussion because their feedback gives insight and inspirations to the participants.

The online coaching of CPI was conducted once a week considering the schedule of the mentee and the mentor. Marsick & Watkins (1990) as cited in Hrastinski & Stenbom (2012) argue how the coaching program's success depends primarily on the students, although the organization put some effort in encouraging them. In line with this statement, mentors’ effort alone cannot outweigh the consistency of the mentees to make progress. Therefore, it is crucial to communicate the program's expectations and objectives to the mentees (Kinash, Knight, & McLean, 2015).

The biggest challenge in online coaching is the internet connection.

“…sometimes it is unavoidable to have a blackout and bad internet connection since I live in a rural area,” Putra said.

“The notification from the social media installed in our gadgets is a distraction,” Sella, female, CPI mentee.

And the most common challenge is maintaining mentees’ consistency to follow the program. According to Hrastinski and Stenbom (2012), interpreting the students’ competence level and how to match a mentee within mentors’ capacity are also other critical challenges in online coaching.

As for the mentor, instability of internet connection, lack of emotional attachment, and visual barriers have been the most common challenges.

“…online coaching limits the emotional attachment between the coach and the mentee,” Anin, female, CPI mentor.

“It is difficult to transfer knowledge and discuss complex issues in the distance due to visual barriers and less sense of connection,” Rohim, male, CPI mentor.

“The biggest challenge of online coaching would be the Internet connection problem and the absence of the sense of closeness,” Bams, male, CPI mentor.

Hence, the mentees were asked to give their evaluation of the effectiveness of OC compared to offline coaching and the answer varied. The mentees who said that offline coaching is more effective has a point that they are motivated
by the direct interaction with the mentors. Another mentee also said that OC might lack human touch compared to the offline coaching since the meeting is virtual and via a gadget, that, in turn, the possibility of having misunderstanding is higher. There is something irreplaceable from offline coaching that is not found in OC, such as feeling the class’s energy and seeing mentors’ body language and gestures. On the other hand, those who prefer OC said that online coaching is more effective since there is no border between mentors and mentees. Hence, OC helps them communicate well, even when they are in different countries.

“...I prefer online since the mentor is still abroad,” Sella, female, CPI mentee.

Online coaching bridges the geographical issue, especially when the OC has a video call, the feeling is quite similar to having offline coaching.

b. Social Networking Site

According to Romero (2015), social media has been used in education in Mexico and South Korea. The research from Hamilton et al. (2016) also found that SNS use is widespread among student pharmacists in pre-pharmacy educational experiences. It is because SNS can nurture the dialogue between coach and coachee (Hrastinski & Stenbom 2012).

The SNS used during the program was WhatsApp, Skype, Zoom, Google Classroom, Google Drive, Gmail, and Instagram. The biggest challenge of using these platforms is the instability of the internet connection. Sometimes the conversation was suddenly stopped due to improper internet connection while using the SNS.

c. The Effectiveness of Online Coaching

The mentees were asked to scale from 1 to 5 about how effective the program from CPI was, 33.3% said that it was very effective, 50% reported effective, and 16.7% chose neutral. They said it was effective because the mentors were supportive and dedicated to guide and help them improve their skills and complete their scholarship application. However, some mentees complained they did not get any chance to have a weekly video call with their mentor, but they were grateful that the mentors were responsive and gave feedback to their assignments accordingly.

The overall feedback from the mentees said that the experience they got from OC with CPI was valuable and relevant. Also, they fully engaged with the program and their mentor.

“We got friends from other areas in Indonesia and mentors who study abroad. We also discuss issues in many countries,” Putra, male, CPI mentee.

The OC has affected mentees’ self-development in terms of character and wellbeing. The side-effect of OC is that mentees tend to be more organized, mainly in time management because they have a deadline for weekly assignments and weekly meetings. They tend to be more optimistic and confident after each session. They got a lot of insight about living abroad and scholarship applications. They are now more determined to make their dreams come true. The significant change they experience after the program is that they are more open-minded, confident, and enjoy the process they are walking through.

“I gained more knowledge about scholarship preparation, and I have someone to ask for whenever I am in doubt in the application process,” Della, female, CPI mentee.

This change happened because they interact with the mentors, share their problems, and discuss the possible solutions for it. The mentors also share their struggle and how they cope with that to learn from mentors’ experience. Sharing sessions from the mentor has been one of the most significant factors that affect the change. Ribbers and Waringa (2015) explained that intrapersonal and interpersonal processes are the key to e-coaching. Research by Burke and Fedorek (2017) also found that online classes are effective.

After the coaching program, the mentees apply for a scholarship and go through the selection process. Although some of the mentees are not accepted yet by any scholarship, they have more confidence to apply for other scholarships.

“I was disappointed at the beginning, but then after I reflected on my improvement, I realised how beneficial the 3 months coaching was. I learned a lot, and I grew so much. Since then, I have maintained my motivation to improve my CV by joining some certifications. Therefore, OC from CPI has inspired me to open my door to access a better future,” Putra, male, CPI mentee.
Nevertheless, even though the program ran smoothly and the response from the mentees were positive, the mentors preferred to have offline coaching rather than online. They believe it is more impactful compared to OC, although OC is more efficient.

"... offline coaching is the preferred one because, in a face-to-face meeting, you have the engagement with each other. If the purpose of coaching is not only training the mentees on how to achieve their goal but also to get value from the program, I think an offline platform must be more accurate," Tia, female, CPI mentor.

"It is more efficient because mentees can easily access the session from anywhere and at any time. However, having offline coaching will be more impactful because the mentee could feel the vibe directly, which could be more memorable," Maria, female, CPI mentor.

4. Discussion

This study aimed to analyse the effectiveness of the 12 weeks of online scholarship coaching from CPI, the most common OC challenge, and the best SNS used for OC. The study was qualitative research with interview-based.

The main reason the mentees are interested in online coaching is the flexibility of online coaching accessible from anywhere as long as they have an internet connection, which also means efficiency. OC is an effective way to get direct and real-time feedback from peers and mentors. Therefore, mentees enjoy an OC because it helps them improve their skills, broaden their knowledge, and learn. In line with the research finding from Hamilton et al. (2016), students in professional schools have a preference for online learning.

CPI chose to use SNS to engage with modern generations, which are digital-friendly (Darginavičienė & Navickienė 2016). Social media brings the “opportunity to change minds in learning contexts” (Schrader 2015). Ribbers and Waringa (2015) state “World Wide Web is almost limitless access and creates opportunities that have been available to no other generation in history.” Furthermore, they also noted that there are about three billion internet users in 2015, which means there is a significant opportunity to engage with people by utilising this platform.

OC through SNS is the right choice because based on the feedback from the mentors and mentees, the use of SNS is convenient because they can access it from all types of gadgets. SNS makes the learning process flexible (Alshahrani, 2019). According to Raj, Bhattacherjee and Mukherjee (2018) “SNSs are designed to encourage the sharing of information”, also to gain knowledge and connect with people without borders (Prestridge, 2019). SNS builds a sense of belonging where people can share their common anxiety (Robson, 2018). Some of the SNS can influence academic performance (Raj, Bhattacherjee & Mukherjee, 2018), including Facebook, Twitter, WhatsApp, Hike, Orkut, Tumblr (2018). These platforms provide a virtual learning space to discuss and work on a task beyond the classroom (Romero, 2015). Therefore, SNS had helped the mentees to share knowledge and material. In support of this, Romero (2015) in his research in Mexico found that SNS facilitates learners to share knowledge in developing their cognitive skills.

The SNSs used during OC of CPI are WhatsApp, Skype, Google Classroom, Google Drive, and Gmail, and the interviewees were satisfied with these platforms. However, there are some other SNS that can be chosen as an alternative for having a different experience, including Ning and Edmodo (Al-Azawei, 2019), Blackboard (Baranik, Wright & Reburn 2017), blog and Twitter (Kind & Evans 2015), Zoom and Moodle (Paruheva, Aleksandrova & Hadzhikolev, 2018), learning management systems (LMS) (Al-Azawei, 2019), Webinar (Alshahrani, 2019), and Adobe Connect, Collaborate, Big Blue Button, and WebEx (Alshahrani, 2019). The essential factors in OC through an SNS are engagement, motivation, and satisfaction (Ellahi, 2018). Then, creating a pleasant, supportive, and inclusive environment will bring advantage to the success of the educational program (Raj, Bhattacherjee & Mukherjee, 2018). Consequently, it can bring professional growth (Kind & Evans, 2015).

The researcher analyses the effectiveness of online coaching based on the four levels of the Kirkpatrick Model, including reaction, learning, behaviour, and results.
This study discovers two contrary reactions (level 1) about the effectiveness of online coaching. While mentees thought OC was effective, the majority of the mentors thought it was not effective. It might be because the mentors have a huge expectation of what the program could do, but the achievement of the mentees is not as good as expected by the mentors. However, the mentors did not know the significant change experienced by the mentees. From the interview with the mentees, they thought they achieved something better than the scholarship itself, which is the confidence that they can do so much better after knowing their potential. They also learn how to utilise their potential, and these all were taught throughout the coaching program. An interesting finding, the mentees are confident that the program was valuable and relevant for them, and they fully engaged throughout the process. In contrast, some of the mentors felt that their mentees had low engagement. The different reactions may be caused by the lack of connection the mentors have with their mentees. As Song, Kim and Luo (2015) explained, improving the positive relationship between student and the facilitator can enhance the effectiveness of the online learning process. The facilitator needs to communicate more with the students and personalise the teaching method to each individual. It is crucial to create a high engagement because it will improve the learning outcomes (Ellahi 2018, p. 65; Baranik, Wright & Reburn, 2017) and collaboration among coachees (Prestridge, 2019; Romero, 2015).

Level 2 is analysing the learning experience. After the program, the mentees are confident and determined to apply to the scholarships. They are also more focused in terms of preparing all the required documents and skills for the applications. During the program, they learn how to be resilient and perseverant. And the tangible skills they can see is they are better at essay writing. It illustrates the outcome of the coaching process, which aims to transfer skills from mentor to mentee and transfer mindset. In line with Oreopoulos et al. (2020) findings, coaching programs through text-message partly contributed to the better performance of coachee at the university.

Level 3 is about behaviour. Engaging with visionary people has helped mentees to change their behaviour. Mentees became more disciplined in working on their tasks. They now trust their dream and enjoy the process they have. Besides, mentors believed that their encouragement and support helped the mentees improve their skills and build their characters. Mentees got more insight and perspective about scholarship and living abroad. Mentees are more optimistic in seeing their future and progress. Supportive peers and mentors help the participant to succeed in online classes (Baranik, Wright & Reburn, 2017).

Level 4 is the result. The outcomes of the OC were mentees are well prepared to apply for a scholarship. Then, they are willing to share the knowledge they gain from coaching to other people. Also important to note, they have new like-minded friends with a common goal, and they grow personally and professionally. Lastly, the mentees know their potential and how to exercise it.
Despite all the challenges in conducting an online coaching, there are numerous benefits from the program, including helping mentee to improve and reach the outcome of the coaching program. It shows that the online scholarship coaching conducted by CPI was effective. “The benefits of online lectures outweigh the disadvantages” stated Kinash, Knight & McLean (2015).

4. Conclusion

In conclusion, online scholarship coaching with Coach Potato Indonesia was effective. Although there are some challenges throughout the process, the collaboration between mentees and mentors can tackle the problem. Online coaching is an effective alternative to improve skills and build characters. The study shows that supportive and dedicated mentors who can create an effective and engaging learning process are essential for the mentees. Mentors who can create a personalised discussion would tend to engage the mentees into the coaching process.

Moreover, OC is considered to be efficient due to its flexibility, that participants might attend the course from different places. Accordingly, participants could save the cost and time supposed to be allocated for travelling. However, the biggest challenge is the instability of the internet connection and mentees’ inconsistency. The study shows that the relationship and engagement between mentor and mentee could tackle the problem of mentees’ inconsistency.

This study has its limitations, particularly in terms of a recommendation to the lack of internet connection which hinders the coaching process. The researchers realise that problems related to internet infrastructure are beyond the scope of this study. However, it is suggested for further study to investigate the deeper impact of internet infrastructure to the implementation of online coaching or online learning in general. Comparing data from the government and mentees' experience on online learning in a less-developed internet infrastructure setting would contribute to developing more creative ways of conducting online learning.

Acknowledgements

We would like to express our gratitude to Coach Potato Indonesia as well as all the mentors and mentees who gave us the golden opportunity to analyse and discuss the effectiveness of online scholarship coaching through social networking sites.

References


